



**{In Archive} RE: Now, EPA is skeptical.....**

**Michael Blumenthal** to: Lassiter, Allan, Gilbert, James, Mark  
Schuknecht, aohare, amalendu.baqchi,  
Audrey.Copeland, blake.nelson,

06/18/2009 04:33 PM

From: "Michael Blumenthal" <mblumenthal@rma.org>  
To: "Lassiter, Allan" <Allan.Lassiter@deq.virginia.gov>, "Gilbert, James"  
<JGILBERT@EMPIRE.STATE.NY.US>, Mark Schuknecht/DC/USEPA/US@EPA,  
<aohare@cement.org>, <amalendu.baqchi@Wisconsin.gov>, <Audrey.Copeland@dot.gov>,  
Archive: This message is being viewed in an archive.

Not everything is what it might seem to be. I would  
suggest that there could be some better news on the  
horizon. Stay tuned...

-----Original Message-----

From: Lassiter, Allan [  
mailto:Allan.Lassiter@deq.virginia.gov]  
Sent: Friday, June 12, 2009 5:42 PM  
To: Gilbert, James; schuknecht.mark@epamail.epa.gov;  
aohare@cement.org; amalendu.baqchi@Wisconsin.gov;  
Audrey.Copeland@dot.gov;  
blake.nelson@dot.state.mn.us;  
byron.lord@fhwa.dot.gov; Bob.Large@epa.state.oh.us;  
cgjohnso@smtpgate.dphe.state.co.us;  
chackath@tceq.state.tx.us; cyoung@CIWMB.ca.gov;  
Peck.Cara@epamail.epa.gov;  
Newman.Christopherm@epamail.epa.gov;  
Clint.Cook@deq.ok.gov; dan@acugreen.com;  
dan.fester@dnr.mo.gov; davenptl@dhec.sc.gov;  
**Non responsive**; DBAKER@idem.IN.gov;  
DeGeare.Truett@epa.gov; denise@dkebusinesses.com;  
Djsnapp@smtpgate.dphe.state.co.us;  
dkeller@CIWMB.ca.gov; dougc@rubberpavements.org;  
elizabeth.mcmanus@ross-assoc.com;  
ethan\_Mayeu@deq.state.ms.us;  
EHOOVER@adeq.state.ar.us;  
Kanipe.Ellie@epamail.epa.gov;  
fieldprograms@cvswwd.org;  
Fenton.Rood@deq.state.ok.us;  
Ferrella.March@deq.ok.gov; George.Gilbert@ky.gov;  
gilliasa@dhec.sc.gov; gmontgom@tceq.state.tx.us;  
greg.hendrick@lafarge-na.com;  
pillsbury.hope@epamail.epa.gov;  
Jan.Rae.Clark@dep.state.fl.us;  
Jason.Harrington@fhwa.dot.gov; **Non responsive**;  
**Non responsive**; john.gowan@deq.ok.gov;  
JonathanLevy@isri.org; keri.meyers@la.gov;  
kfishman@mmce.net; kste461@ECY.wa.gov;  
larry@polyvulcusa.com; lisa.evans@ky.gov;  
lago.carlos@epamail.epa.gov; madler@deq.ok.gov;  
mary@scraptirenews.com; Hunt.Mary@epamail.epa.gov;  
mbenoit@ckrc.org; mdelmage@ciwmb.ca.gov; Michael  
Blumenthal; mlewis@cablelynx.com;  
Hoyles.Mike@epamail.epa.gov; **Non responsive**;  
pamela.moore@ncmail.net; rbohn@utah.gov;  
Richard.Colyar@cmworks.com;  
Picardi.Rick@epamail.epa.gov;  
Schuknecht.mark@epa.gov; ScottHorne@ISRI.org;

serji.amirkhanian@ces.clemson.edu;  
snowbarger.robert@epa.gov;  
Smith.SteveD@epamail.epa.gov; taylor.timothy@epa.gov;  
tagray@flash.net; terio@CLEMSON.EDU;  
**Non responsive**; tlanders@libertytire.com;  
Todd.Marvel@illinois.gov; toni.duggan@state.nm.us;  
Tracey Norberg; twilson@cement.org; twoy@state.pa.us;  
uvidiva@hotmail.com; vonni.kallemeyn@state.sd.us;  
WHITEJM@dhec.sc.gov; Winthrop\_Brown@dnr.state.ga.us;  
wrightwj@dhec.sc.gov; zicari@eng.buffalo.edu  
Subject: Now, EPA is skeptical.....

EPA documents raise concerns about shredded tires  
By Bruce Geiselman

June 8 -- The U.S. EPA is examining whether shredded tires are safe to use on playgrounds. The agency for years has recommended the use of shredded tires for public recreational purposes, but data gaps and conflicting opinions about toxicological risks have the agency re-examining the issue.

"Where we are right now is, we just don't have a recommendation," EPA spokesman Dale Kemery said. "I wish we did."

Public Employees for Environmental Responsibility, an advocacy group whose members include state and federal environmental professionals, released internal EPA documents June 4 that raise questions about potential health risks from children ingesting or inhaling toxic chemicals found within tires, including arsenic, cadmium, chromium, mercury and hydrocarbons. In addition, the agency is looking into possible lead contamination of artificial turf, which frequently is manufactured with shredded tires among its components. The lead is believed to come from pigments that make the surfaces green. An EPA workgroup is looking at both issues.

"We've got a scoping survey, which is nearing completion," Kemery said. "That's a small-scale survey, which is intended to find out if there is a potential human health or environmental problem with artificial turf and from rubber fields," Kemery said.

Once the agency has the results back, it will have a better idea of what to do next, he said. However, he said he didn't know when the survey results would be available.

Meanwhile, agencies are issuing contradictory advice to consumers, according to PEER. The Centers for Disease Control in June 2008 issued an advisory for potential lead exposure from artificial turf. Meanwhile, weeks later, the Consumer Product Safety Commission issued a press release downplaying the lead risk, saying the findings were based on very limited testing, according to PEER.

Among the EPA documents PEER released was an internal memo from Stephen Tuber, the EPA assistant regional administrator in Denver, in which he expressed concerns about a lack of data about possible toxicological risks to children.

In Tuber's January 2008 memo, he noted the EPA recommends the use of recycled tire crumb for various applications, including playground surfaces. However, he said it "would be prudent for EPA to look further into its safety and make sure that there is a scientific basis for EPA's promotion of certain uses of the product."

PEER also called for the agency to do more.

"Despite growing concerns of its own scientists, EPA has issued no public statement of caution and still promotes tire crumbs in playgrounds," PEER Executive Director Jeff Ruch said.

PEER sent a letter dated May 29 to EPA Administrator Lisa Jackson asking she formally revoke the agency's endorsement of tire crumb until the research concludes it is safe for children. The group also wants the EPA to issue an interim public health advisory and outline a coordinated plan to work with other agencies on assessing possible risks.

A spokesman for the Rubber Manufacturers Association, a trade group, said the association believes recycled tires are safe for recreational purposes and accused opponents of waging a "misinformation campaign."

"The inference is they are looking for data gaps," RMA Senior Vice President Michael Blumenthal said of EPA scientists. "I do not assume that to mean they are having second thoughts or that they would come out with anything negative."

"I think the opponents are jumping on anything, any news that comes out. They are just prepared with their canned statements and their lack of evidence to continue the misinformation campaign they are waging."

Blumenthal pointed to several studies that concluded using recycled rubber for recreational purposes does not pose health risks.

EMAIL THIS STORY | PRINTER FRIENDLY | ORDER REPRINTS

Allan Lassiter  
Manager, Virginia Waste Tire Program  
Virginia Department of Environmental Quality  
arlassiter@deq.virginia.gov  
(804) 698-4215  
(804) 698-4224 (fax)  
Office Location: 629 East Main Street, Richmond, Va  
23219

Postal address: PO Box 1105, Richmond, Va. 23218

-----Original Message-----

From: Gilbert, James [  
mailto:JGILBERT@EMPIRE.STATE.NY.US]  
Sent: Friday, June 05, 2009 2:54 PM  
To: schuknecht.mark@epamail.epa.gov;  
aohare@cement.org; amalendu.baqchi@Wisconsin.gov;  
Lassiter,Allan; Audrey.Copeland@dot.gov;  
blake.nelson@dot.state.mn.us;  
byron.lord@fhwa.dot.gov; Bob.Large@epa.state.oh.us;  
cgjohnso@smtpgate.dphe.state.co.us;  
chackath@tceq.state.tx.us; cyoung@CIWMB.ca.gov;  
Peck.Cara@epamail.epa.gov;  
Newman.Christopherm@epamail.epa.gov;  
Clint.Cook@deq.ok.gov; dan@acugreen.com;  
dan.fester@dnr.mo.gov; davenptl@dhec.sc.gov;  
**Non responsive**; DBAKER@idem.IN.gov;  
DeGeare.Truett@epa.gov; denise@dkebusinesses.com;  
Djsnapp@smtpgate.dphe.state.co.us;  
dkeller@CIWMB.ca.gov; dougc@rubberpavements.org;  
elizabeth.mcmanus@ross-assoc.com;  
ethan\_Mayeu@deq.state.ms.us;  
EHOOVER@adeq.state.ar.us;  
Kanipe.Ellie@epamail.epa.gov;  
fieldprograms@cvswmd.org;  
Fenton.Rood@deq.state.ok.us;  
Ferrella.March@deq.ok.gov; George.Gilbert@ky.gov;  
gilliasa@dhec.sc.gov; gmontgom@tceq.state.tx.us;  
greg.hendrick@lafarge-na.com;  
pillsbury.hope@epamail.epa.gov;  
Jan.Rae.Clark@dep.state.fl.us;  
Jason.Harrington@fhwa.dot.gov; **Non responsive**;  
**Non responsive**; john.gowan@deq.ok.gov;  
JonathanLevy@isri.org; keri.meyers@la.gov;  
kfishman@mmce.net; kste461@ECY.wa.gov;  
larry@polyvulcusa.com; lisa.evans@ky.gov;  
lago.carlos@epamail.epa.gov; madler@deq.ok.gov;  
mary@scraptirenews.com; Hunt.Mary@epamail.epa.gov;  
mbenoit@ckrc.org; mdlmage@ciwmb.ca.gov;  
michael@rma.org; mlewis@cablelynx.com;  
Hoyles.Mike@epamail.epa.gov; **Non responsive**;  
pamela.moore@ncmail.net; rbohn@utah.gov;  
Richard.Colyar@cmworks.com;  
Picardi.Rick@epamail.epa.gov;  
Schuknecht.mark@epa.gov; ScottHorne@ISRI.org;  
serji.amirkhanian@ces.clemson.edu;  
snowbarger.robert@epa.gov;  
Smith.SteveD@epamail.epa.gov; taylor.timothy@epa.gov;  
tagray@flash.net; terio@CLEMSON.EDU;  
**Non responsive**; tlanders@libertytire.com;  
Todd.Marvel@illinois.gov; toni.duggan@state.nm.us;  
tracey@rma.org; twilson@cement.org; twoy@state.pa.us;  
**Non responsive**; vonni.kallemeyn@state.sd.us;  
WHITEJM@dhec.sc.gov; Winthrop\_Brown@dnr.state.ga.us;  
wrightwj@dhec.sc.gov; zicari@eng.buffalo.edu  
Subject: New York Artificial Turf Report

Hi all,

Sorry for not getting this to you sooner. By now you

might have  
received it from other sources. It came out late  
last Friday after I  
left for the day and by Monday morning I was running  
around getting  
ready to go to the Buffalo tire conferences that  
started Tues.

The release of this report was very timely. Dr. Ly  
Lim of the DEC, who  
oversaw the study, spoke on its contents at our  
conference.

<http://www.dec.ny.gov/press/54966.html>

<http://www.dec.ny.gov/chemical/46856.html>

Jim Gilbert  
Empire State Development  
Environmental Services Unit  
400 Andrews Street, Suite 100  
Rochester, NY 14604  
(585) 325-1944 x229  
Fax (585) 325-6505  
Email [jgilbert@empire.state.ny.us](mailto:jgilbert@empire.state.ny.us)  
Web [www.empire.state.ny.us/environment](http://www.empire.state.ny.us/environment)